

STC Alternative and Workgroup Vote

CM086: Introducing Competitively Appointed Transmission Owners & Transmission Service Providers

Please note: To participate in any votes, Workgroup members need to have attended at least 50% of meetings.

Stage 1 - Alternative Vote

If Workgroup Alternative Requests have been made, vote on whether they should become Alternative STC Modifications.

Stage 2 - Workgroup Vote

2a) Assess the Original solution and Alternative STC Modifications (if there are any) against the STC objectives compared to the baseline (the current STC).

2b) If Alternative STC Modifications exist, vote on whether each Alternative STC Modification better facilitates the Applicable STC Objectives better than the Original Modification Proposal.

2c) Vote on which of the options is best.

Terms used in this document

Term	Meaning
Baseline	The current STC (if voting for the Baseline, you believe no modification should be made)
Original	The solution which was firstly proposed by the Proposer of the modification
Alternative STC Modification	An Alternative Solution which has been developed by the Workgroup

The Applicable STC Objectives are:

- (a) efficient discharge of the obligations imposed upon transmission licensees by transmission licences and the Act
- (b) development, maintenance and operation of an efficient, economical and coordinated system of electricity transmission
- (c) facilitating effective competition in the generation and supply of electricity, and (so far as consistent therewith) facilitating such competition in the distribution of electricity
- (d) protection of the security and quality of supply and safe operation of the national electricity transmission system insofar as it relates to interactions between transmission licensees

- (e) promotion of good industry practice and efficiency in the implementation and administration of the arrangements described in the STC.
- (f) facilitation of access to the national electricity transmission system for generation not yet connected to the national electricity transmission system or distribution system;
- (g) compliance with the Electricity Regulation and any relevant legally binding decision of the European Commission and/or the Agency.

Workgroup Vote

Stage 1 – Alternative Vote

Vote on Workgroup Alternative Requests to become Alternative STC Modifications.

The Alternative vote is carried out to identify the level of Workgroup support there is for any potential alternative options that have been brought forward by either any member of the Workgroup OR an Industry Participant as part of the Workgroup Consultation.

Should the majority of the Workgroup OR the Chair believe that the potential alternative solution would better facilitate the STC objectives (against Baseline or the Proposer's modification) then the potential alternative will be fully developed by the Workgroup with legal text to form Alternative STC Modifications and submitted to the Panel and Authority alongside the Proposer's Modification for the Panel Recommendation vote and the Authority decision.

“Y” = Yes

“N” = No

“-“ = Neutral (Stage 2 only)

“Abstain”

No Alternative requests were raised for this Modification.

Stage 2a – Assessment against objectives

To assess the Original and Alternative STC Modifications against the STC objectives compared to the baseline (the current STC).

You will also be asked to provide a statement to be added to the Workgroup Report alongside your vote to assist the reader in understanding the rationale for your vote.

ASO = Applicable STC Objective

ASM = Alternative STC Modifications

Workgroup Member	Better facilitates ASO (a)	Better facilitates ASO (b)	Better facilitates ASO (c)	Better facilitates ASO (d)	Better facilitates ASO (e)	Better facilitates ASO (f)	Better facilitates ASO (g)	Overall (Y/N)
	Alana Collis-Dugmore – National Grid ESO							
Original	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Voting Statement: <i>The changes in this modification of the STC successfully introduce Competitively Appointed Transmission Owners and their roles alongside other, parallel modifications to Codes.</i>								

Workgroup Member	Better facilitates ASO (a)	Better facilitates ASO (b)	Better facilitates ASO (c)	Better facilitates ASO (d)	Better facilitates ASO (e)	Better facilitates ASO (f)	Better facilitates ASO (g)	Overall (Y/N)
	Joel Matthews – Diamond Transmission Corp							
Original	Y	-	-	-	-	-	-	Y
Voting Statement:								

Workgroup Member	Better facilitates ASO (a)	Better facilitates ASO (b)	Better facilitates ASO (c)	Better facilitates ASO (d)	Better facilitates ASO (e)	Better facilitates ASO (f)	Better facilitates ASO (g)	Overall (Y/N)
	Greg Stevenson – Scottish Hydro Electric Transmission Ltd							
Original	Y	-	-	-	-	-	-	Y
Voting Statement: Objective A is better facilitated as this modification is introducing the concept of Competitively Appointed Transmission Owners (CATOs) to the STC. Following the Energy Bill receiving Royal Assent, this mod is required to effectively facilitate the new legislation, so we support it overall. The modification should ensure the obligations CATOs must adhere to when they become transmission licensees are well defined. Objectives B, C, D, E, F, G are neutral as we do not believe the solution better facilitates these objectives as it introduces a new party into the NETS which increases risk and complexity in the operation of the system.								

Workgroup Member	Better facilitates ASO (a)	Better facilitates ASO (b)	Better facilitates ASO (c)	Better facilitates ASO (d)	Better facilitates ASO (e)	Better facilitates ASO (f)	Better facilitates ASO (g)	Overall (Y/N)
	Mike Lee – TINV							
Original	Y	-	-	-	-	-	-	Y
Voting Statement:								

Of the 4 votes, how many voters said this option was better than the Baseline.

Option	Number of voters that voted this option as better than the Baseline
Original	4

Stage 2b – Alternative STC Modification Vote (If required)

Where one or more Alternative STC Modifications exist, does each Alternative STC Modification better facilitate the Applicable STC Objectives than the Original Modification Proposal?

Workgroup Member	Company	ASM1 better than Proposer's solution Yes/No	ASM2 better than Proposer's solution Yes/No

Stage 2c – Workgroup Vote

Which option is the best? (Baseline, Original Proposal, Alternative STC Modification 1 or Alternative STC Modification 2)

Workgroup Member	Company	BEST Option?	Which objective(s) does the change better facilitate? (if baseline not applicable)
Alana Collis-Dugmore	National Grid ESO	Original	All
Joel Matthews	Diamond Transmission Corp	Original	a)
Greg Stevenson	Scottish Hydro Electric Transmission Ltd	Original	a)

Mike Lee	TINV	Original	a)
----------	------	----------	----